Election in Trees and Rings T-79.4001 Seminar on Theoretical Computer Science

Ilari Nieminen

21.02.2007

Ilari Nieminen Election in Trees and Rings

イロン 不得 とくほ とくほ とう

Outline

Leader Election

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Election in Trees

Elect Minimum and Elect Root Performance

Election in Rings

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

ヘロト ヘアト ヘビト ヘビト

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Outline

Leader Election Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Election in Trees

Elect Minimum and Elect Root Performance

Election in Rings

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

ヘロト ヘアト ヘビト ヘビト

ъ

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Notation

- ► *n* is the number of nodes, *m* is the number of edges
- Standard set of restrictions
 R = {Bidirectional Links, Connectivity, Total Reliability}
- N(x) is the set of neighbours of x
- ▶ **M**[*P*] is the number of messages needed in protocol *P*
- T [P] is the time required in protocol P
- **B** [*P*] is the number of bits needed in protocol *P*

イロン 不得 とくほ とくほ とう

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Election

Leader Election (Elect)

- In the initial configuration all entities are in the same state ("available")
- In the goal configuration all but one are in the same state ("follower")
- Can be thought as enforcing restriction Unique Initiator

ヘロト ヘアト ヘビト ヘビト

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Impossibility Result

- Problem Elect is deterministically unsolvable under R
- Means that there is no protocol that will terminate correctly in finite time
- Easy to prove with two entities when communication delays are unitary

ヘロト ヘアト ヘビト ヘビト

ъ

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Election's Standard Set of Restrictions

Restriction *Initial Distinct Values* (ID) is chosen to break the symmetry between entities. Set $IR = R \cup \{ID\}$ is called the *standard set for election*. id(x) is used to denote the distinct value of entity *x*.

イロン 不得 とくほ とくほ とう

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Elect Minimum

- 1. Find the smallest value id(x)
- 2. Elect the entity with that value as a leader
- This strategy also solves Min.

ヘロト ヘアト ヘビト ヘビト

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Elect Minimum Initiator

- 1. Find the smallest value id(x) among initiators
- 2. Elect the entity with that value as a leader

Does not solve Min.

イロン 不得 とくほ とくほ とう

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Elect Root

- 1. Construct a rooted spanning tree
- 2. Elect the root of the tree as the leader

イロト 不得 とくほと くほとう

Elect Minimum and Elect Root Performance

Outline

eader Election Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Election in Trees

Elect Minimum and Elect Root Performance

Election in Rings

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

ヘロト ヘアト ヘビト ヘビト

Elect Minimum and Elect Root Performance

Elect Minimum in Trees

Tree:Elect_Min

- Using saturation, find the smallest value
- ▶ **M** [*Tree* : *Elect_Min*] = 3*n* + *k*_{*} − 4 ≤ 4*n* − 4

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □

Elect Minimum and Elect Root Performance

Elect Root

- Full Saturation selects two saturated nodes
- Tree:Elect_Root compares the identities of the saturated nodes

• **M** [*Tree* : *Elect_Root*] =
$$3n + k_* - 2 \le 4n - 2$$

◆□ ▶ ◆□ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ● □ ● ● ● ●

Elect Minimum and Elect Root Performance

Tree:Elect_Root

SATURATED Receiving(Election, id) begin if id(x) < id then become LEADER else become FOLLOWER end send (Termination) to N(x)-{parent} end PROCESSING Receiving(Termination) begin become FOLLOWER send (Termination) to N(x)-{parent} end

Procedure Resolve begin send (Election,id(x)) to parent become SATURATED end

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ★ □▶ ★ □▶ → □ → の Q ()

Elect Minimum and Elect Root Performance

Bit Complexity

- Tree:Elect_Root sends two more messages than Tree:Elect_Min
- Number of bits needed is lower for Tree:Elect_Root
- **B** [*Tree* : *Elect_Min*] = $n(c + \log id) + c(2n + k_* 2)$
- ▶ **B** [*Tree* : *Elect_Root*] = $2(c + \log id) + c(3n + k_* 2)$

where c = O(1) denotes the number of bits needed to distinguish between messages.

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲三▶ ▲三▶ 三三 ののの

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

Outline

Leader Election

Election Impossibility Result Solution Strategies

Election in Trees

Elect Minimum and Elect Root Performance

Election in Rings

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

ヘロト ヘアト ヘビト ヘビト

ъ

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

Rings

- A ring consists of a single cycle of length n
- Each entity has exactly two neighbours, whose ports are called "right" and "left"
- It is important to note that this labeling might be inconsistent between entities
- Notation: other is used to denote N(x)-sender
- Any protocol that elects a leader in a ring can be made to find the minimum value with n additional messages

イロン 不得 とくほ とくほ とう

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

All the Way

- On becoming awake entity sends a message to one of its neighbours containing its id
- On receiving a message it forwards the message and keeps note of the smallest id seen
- Because the Message Ordering restriction is not used, an entity won't know that the election is finished when it receives its value back
- To calculate the size of the ring, a counter is added to the message
- Does not actually need the Bidirectional Links restriction

イロン 不得 とくほ とくほ とう

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

All the Way Protocol

```
 \begin{array}{l} \text{States: } \mathcal{S} = \{ \text{ASLEEP}, \text{AWAKE}, \text{FOLLOWER}, \text{LEADER} \} \\ \mathcal{S}_{INIT} = \{ \text{ASLEEP} \} \\ \mathcal{S}_{TERM} = \{ \text{FOLLOWER}, \text{LEADER} \} \end{array}
```

ASLEEP

```
Spontaneously
begin
INITIALIZE
become AWAKE
```

end

```
Receiving("Election", value*, counter*)
```

begin

```
INITIALIZE

send ("Election", value*, counter*+1) to other

count := count+1

min := Min{min, value*}

become AWAKE
```

end

```
AWAKE

Receiving("Election", value*, counter*)

begin

if value* \neq id(x) then

send ("Election", value*, counter*+1) to other

min := MIN{min, value*}

count := count+1

if known then

CHECK

end

else

ringsize := counter*

known := true

CHECK

end
```

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □

end

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

All the Way Procedures

```
Procedure INITIALIZE
begin
     count := 0
     size := 1
     known := false
     send ("Election", id(x), size) to right; min := id(x)
end
Procedure CHECK begin
      if count = ringsize then
           if min = id(x) then
                 become LEADER
           else
                 become FOLLOWER
           end
     end
end
```

イロト 不得 とくほと くほとう

∃ 𝒫𝔅

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

All the Way and All the Way Minimum Initiator

- The cost of All the Way is easily seen
- **M** [AlltheWay] = n^2
- ► T [AlltheWay] ≤ 2n 1
- By modifying the protocol to find the smallest value among the initiators number of messages can be reduced
- $M[AlltheWay : Minit] = nk_* + n$
- ► T [AlltheWay : Minit] ≤ 3n 1
- The additional n is required to inform the ring of termination.

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲三▶ ▲三▶ 三三 ののの

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

As Far As It Can

- The drawback of All the Way is that every message travels the whole ring
- All the Way is modified so that an entity will only forward Election messages if the id in the message is smaller than than the smallest seen so far
- The message with the smallest id will travel the entire ring, so if an entity receives its own id, it knows it is the leader
- The leader notifies the ring to ensure termination

ヘロン 人間 とくほ とくほ とう

э.

General All the Way **As Far As It Can** Controlled Distance

As Far As It Can Message Complexity

 Worst case happens if the ring is "ordered" and all the messages are sent in the "increasing" direction

•
$$M[AsFar] = n + \sum_{i=1}^{n} i = \frac{n(n+3)}{2}$$

- Average case is harder. Let $H_n = 1 + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{3} + \ldots + \frac{1}{n}$
- M [AsFar] = nH_n ≈ .69n log₂ n + O(n) on average in oriented (or unidirectional) rings
 M [AsFar] = √2/2 nH_n ≈ .49n log₂ n + O(n) on average in unoriented rings (assuming half of the "rights" correspond to the clockwise direction)

ヘロト 人間 とくほとく ほとう

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

Controlled Distance

- ► The downside with As Far As It Can is that O(n²) performance is still possible
- Controlled Distance has guaranteed O(n log n) message performance
- Idea is to limit the distance a message can travel and send multiple messages if necessary

ヘロン 人間 とくほ とくほ とう

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

Controlled Distance Basics

- 1. Entity *x* sends a message with its own id, and the message will travel until it is terminated (by a smaller id) or until it reaches a distance *dis*.
- 2. If the message is not terminated, it will be sent back to its originator. After receiving the returned message, it knows there are no smaller ids on that side of the ring within distance *dis*.
- 3. To confirm that there are no smaller ids on either side, the entity will send the message in both directions. If they both come back, next time the message will be allowed to travel further.

イロン 不得 とくほ とくほ とう

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

Controlled Distance Basics (cont.)

- 4. If at any time an entity receives a message with a smaller id, it will stop trying to win the election
- 5. If an entity receives its own message back from the other side, it knows it is the leader and notifies the ring

イロン 不得 とくほ とくほ とう

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

Controlled Distance Correctness

- The correctness can intuitively be understood through the following observations
- Messages containing the smallest id will always travel the maximum allocated distance.
- Every candidate that meets the messages will give up
- Allocated distance is increased monotonically, so at some point, a message with the minimum id will travel through the whole ring

・ロト ・ 同ト ・ ヨト ・ ヨト … ヨ

Controlled Distance

Protocol Control

States: S = {ASLEEP, CANDIDATE, DEFEATED, FOLLOWER, LEADER} $S_{INIT} = \{ASLEEP\}$ $S_{TEBM} = \{FOLLOWER, LEADER\}$ ASLEEP Spontaneously beain INITIALIZE become CANDIDATE; end Receiving("Forth", id*, stage*, limit*) begin if $id^* < id(x)$ then PROCESS-MESSAGE become DEFEATED else INITIALIZE become CANDIDATE

end

DEFEATED

```
Receiving(*)
```

end

begin

```
send (*) to other
```

if * = "Notify" then become FOLLOWER

end

```
end
```

CANDIDATE Receiving("Forth", id*, stage*, limit*) begin if $id^* < id(x)$ then PROCESS-MESSAGE become DEFEATED else if $id^* = id(x)$ then NOTIEY end end end Receiving("Back", id*) beain if $id^* = id(x)$ then CHÈĆK end end Receiving("Notify") begin send ("Notify") to other become FOLLOWER end

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

Procedures of protocol Control

```
Procedure INITIALIZE
                                                                  Procedure NOTIFY
begin
                                                                  begin
      stage := 1
                                                                        send ("Notify") to right
      limit := dis(stage)
                                                                        become LEADER
                                                                  end
      count := 0
      send ("Forth", id(x), stage, limit) to N(x)
end
Procedure PBOCESS-MESSAGE
begin
     limit* := limit* -1
      if limit^* = 0 then
            send ("Back", id*, stage*) to sender
      else
            send ("Forth", id*, stage*, limit*) to other
      end
end
Procedure CHECK
begin
      count := count+1
      if count = 2 then
            count := 0
            stage := stage+1
            limit := dis(stage)
            send ("Forth", id(x), stage, limit) to N(x)
      end
```

end

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □

General All the Way As Far As It Can Controlled Distance

Message Complexity of Control

- Performance depends on choice of dis(i)
- Let dis⁻¹(*n*) denote smallest integer *k* such that dis(*k*) \geq *n*.

•
$$\mathbf{M}[Control] \leq n \sum_{i=1}^{dis^{-1}(n)} \left(3 \frac{dis(i)}{dis(i-1)} + 1\right) + n$$

► If distance is doubled at each stage \mathbf{M} [*Control*] $\leq 7n \log n + O(n)$

•
$$\mathbf{T}[Control] \leq 2n + \sum_{i=1}^{dis^{-1}(n)} 2dis(i)$$

イロン 不得 とくほ とくほ とう